RAJYA SABHA

Wednesday, the 23rd July, 1986/1st Sravana, 1908 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock.

Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

MEMBERS SWORN

Shri Jaswant Singh (Rajasthan)

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall now take up Question. Question No. 81.

Non availability of medicines in the CGHS dispensaries

*81. SHRI J. P. GOYAL: Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that generally the medicines prescribed to patients by the specialists are not readily available in the C.G.H.S. dispensaries and that these are indented for local purchase;

(b) whether it is also a fact that this procedure takes about three to four days and the patient is able to get the treatment only after four to five days;

(c) whether it is also a fact that sometimes the indented medicines also are not supplied and after four to five days the patient is asked to purchase the medicines from the market; and

(d) if so, what remedial measures Government propose to take in this regard?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH (KUMARI SAROJ KHAPARDE): (a) to (d) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

The C.G.H.S. dispensaries in general stock the medicines usually prescribed by the specialists. However, there are occasions when particular medicines prescribed may be out of stock at a given point of time. In such cases arrangements are made to supply the medicines through the Super Bazar. The Medical Officer-In-Charge has also the authority to permit immediate local purchase in case of non-availability of any life saving or essential medicine from any local chemist. In order to ensure that such situations do not arise frequently, the stock position of medicines available in the C.G.H.S. dispensaries is reviewed from time to time and remedial steps taken.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Maiden reply!

SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER: Maiden's reply!

SHRI J. P. GOYAL: Sir, in a letter to the Editor of the 'Hindustan Times', one **Shri B. Krishnamoorthy** drew the attention of the public—I want to read only a few extracts from that letter—about the horrible condition of CGHS dispensaries:

> "Through its 'Roving Eye' the Doordarshan had given a glimpse of the deplorable conditions prevailing in most of the dispensaries run under the Central Government Health Scheme in Delhi. What was shown was only the tip of the iceberg and there are many skeleton in the cuboard of the CGHS which remain unexposed. In the programme it was also shown that the dispensaries located in the elitist areas are kept spick and span, and the service provided is quick and efficient.
>
> "Though the CGHS was originally conceived as a well-fare scheme every beneficiary will agree it is a nightmarish experiences to visit the dispensaries particularly when one is seriouly ill or suffering from some acute disease. The doctors and other staff adopt..."

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your question? Please put you question. You are making a statement.

SHRI J. P. GOYAL: My question is, when the patient goes and he requires certain medicines, then he is told that unless

the specialist prescribes and all that these cannot be supplied. This happens three or four time, and the patient suffers, and in the meantime he becomes more ill. How does the Minister propose to cure this situation?

KUMARI SAROJ KHAPARDE: Sir, just as the hon. Member has mentioned, there was a programme on TV which I have not seen, but I have seen a letter to the Editor in the Press about the non-availability of certain drugs. The use of particular drug has been discontinued by the specialists lately. The drugs was de-listed from the formulary which was prescribed earlier. And the prescription was in continuation of the old prescription.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Second supplementary.

SHRI J. P. GOYAL: Sir, I understand that certain medicines are sent to medical centres when their time is going to expire. They are sent at that time, and not before. So they are not also vigilant about it. It is a fact that all the medicines which should be there are not there in the CGHS dispensaries. What is the reason? Why are they not available all the time?

KUMARI SAROJ KHAPARDE: There are 164 medicines included in the formulary, and against that number 134 medicines are available in the dispensaries. This shows that 82 per cent of the listed medicine are available in the dispensaries. Sir, I may add for the information of the House that the medicines which are not included in the formulary but are prescribed by the specialists...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have not understood the question.

KUMARI SAROJ KHAPARDE: He was asking whether all the medicines are available in the dispensaries.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He said that you are sending medicines which are about to be time-expired. Therefore, even when they come, they become expired and the patients are not able to use them.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, this is a very sweeping statement. It is not possible to give a comprehensive answer to it. Generally, it is not conceivable that only medicines which are about to expire are sent to these dispensaries or hospitals. This cannot be correct in all cases. If there are any instances, we will certainly look into them.

श्री पशुपति नाथ सुकुल : उपसभापति महोदय, इस जवाब में यह दिया हुआ है कि सामान्यत: दवाएं रखी जाती हैं जिनको विशेषज्ञ आमतौर पर मरीजों के लिए लिखते है। मेरा अपना अनुभव यह है कि ऐसी दवाएं नहीं रखी जाती हैं। पिछले पांच वर्ष से मैं सी०जी०एच०एस० डिस्पेंसरी सेर दवा लेता हूं। हर महीने और हर रोज दवा लेता हूं। तीन ब्लडप्रेशर की और तीन डायबीटीज की गोलियां लेता हूं। आज तक ये दवाएं समय पर नहीं मिली हैं। जिस रोज भी आदमी लेने के लिए जाता है तो कहा जाता है कि दो तीन दिन में आ जाएंगी। एम० पीज० केसाथ यह स्थिति है। इसलिए मैंने कहा कि दवाएं रखी नहीं जाती हैं। एक एम० पी० चार साल, पांच साल तक रहता है। होना तो यह चाहिए कि जैसे ही आदमी दवा के लिए जाए तो वे मिल जानी चाहिएं। यहां तक कि मामूली-सी दवाएं डायोनिल, ग्लाइसीफाज और बीटालाक भी नहीं मिलती है। तीन-चार बार आदमी को दौड़ना पड़ता है। खास तौर पर एम० पीज० के साथ यह स्थिति है।

KUMARI SAROJ KHAPARDE: Sir, 80 per cent of the medicines are available in the dispensaries. In case of non-availabilit yof any particular item, arrangements are made with the Super Bazar for the supply of such medicines direcly to the concerned dispensary on receipt of indent. When there is a prescription for a long period, the Medical Officers have

been advised to procure the entire quantity, but to make the supply for a shorter interval at a time so as to avoid wastage due to non-use. However, in all chronic cases, medicines are issued for a period up to one month by the Medical-Officer in-charge and for a longer period on sanction from the Deputy Director of the C.G.H.S.

SHRI A. G KULKARNI: Sir, the energetic Minister has now to give some answers without seeing the papers. This is an advice to you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That advice need not be accepted.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Sir, as a Minister, you could also read at home, but you had to come prepared here to reply without going on reading. Now, I come to my question. I don't want to quarrel with Saroj Khaparde. As a Member, I was quarrelling with her. Now she is a Minister. Let her have peace. I would like to know from the hon. Minister..... (*Interruptions*). Mr. Advani is prompting me. I am not doing that. (*Interruptions*). He is prompting me. Now I come to my question. Mr. Sukul has rightly pointed out. The problem in Delhi is that these C.G.H.S. dispesaries are usually short of medicine. Then the specialist problem comes. Mr. Narasimha Rao may say that it is a sweeping statement. What I want to say is that whenever we visit the dispensaries, we find that the medicines very near to the expiry date are being administered. There must be some time lag. It must be there at least for a year or for six months. My specific question is that people are suffering because they have got to get certificates. In my case, I brought a certificate from the specialist at Pune because I am examined there I brought it to the Parliament House dispensary. The doctors here are very obliging. They asked me to get another certificate from the doctor here. Then I had to go to Pandara Road Dispensary. That gentleman says:

"डिस्पेसरी में नहीं है, परचेज करना पड़ेगा।'

Then I asked her,

कितने दिन लगेंगे ?

She said,

"परमात्मा जाने। इंडेंट करेंगे। कभी मिलेगा तो मालूम होगा।"

That is one thing, Sir. Then, Sir, my doctor and this doctor agreed that I should be given the medicines for a three-month stock because after this Session, for two months I will be at my home. Either you pay at my home or not, I do not know. But, Sir, this is the difficulty. If you want Sir, I will read out what the Pandara Road doctor has said. He said that the medicine should be given for 15 days only. It should be indented and as soon as it is received, it should be given. Sir, this is the position as Mr. Sukul has rightly pointed out of the MPs. I have shown you, Sir, this letter. The people and the MPs do suffer from the same disease out of your CGHS hospital. So, I would request the Minister to improve the service and be a little sympathetic towards the patients.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Particularly MPs.

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI: No, Sir. I strongly object, Sir. I have not pleaded for the MPs. I have pleaded for the system. The system is not proper.

SHRI P.V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, my colleague has already given the details of the system that is working at the moment. We have taken a decision to review it in the next few days. We have just taken over. Sir, I think, we should in all fairness get a few more days to look into the system and see what more can be done to improve it. It is true that most of the medicines are available. It is also true that some of the medicines are not available. In the case of Mr. Sukul, I entirely sympathise with him because that is my need also. I will see to it that these very common medicines like Daonil, etc. are stocked there,

and there should be no difficulty in getting them at short notice. They are not really so difficult to procure. But at some point of time there may be some difficulty. But as we go along, we will have to solve those difficulties. But we will certainy see to it as to how the difficulties would be obviated in advance to the extent possible, I cannot say that 100 per cent they will be solved. There will be still some laxity somewhere, but we will try to minimise it as far as possible.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: Sir, besides the non-availablilty of medicines at the CGHS dispensaries, the other thing that ails these dispensaries is the non-supply of good medicines. If an inventory were to be prepared of the medicines available in these dispensaries, you would see that a good number of medicines there are those which are, in fact, doled out to the patients by the registered medical practitioners in the villages. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether in the face of the State Governments having expressed their inability to carry out the statuory tests in the factories would the Government here ensure that in any event in the case of the CGHS dispensaries, before the purchase of the medicines a panel would be constituted to carry out a proper test on every batch of medicines purchased.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: That is already being done. That is why there is some delay. Actually, one reason for the delay is... (Interruption) We are going into it again as I have said.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: That has not improved the position

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, the thorough manner in which these medicines are tested takes a long time. But we will see that even that time is minimised. And without testing no medicine is given.

SHRI M. KADHARSHA: Sir, the hon. Minister is aware that anti-epileptic drugs like Luminol and Gardinol are life-saving drugs. Even if the continuity of the drugs is left for one day, it will have serious consequences on the patient; he may even collapse. But, Sir, there is difficutly even in getting these life-saving drugs. Sir, some time during the last month the TV crew undertook an on the spot inspection of the Kishenganj CGHS dispensary which is the only CGHS dispernsary catering to the needs of 15 million people in the trans-Yumuna area. A boy was called and he said that he was not getting the drug for the last three days. When the TV crew asked the Medical Officer, she said that the "pharmacist is a new man and so he cannot locate the medicine." The Minister says that the reviews are undertaken. By whom the the reviews are undertaken? What action was taken against those who are negligent? Sir, if a premium is paid the medicines are available. Has any report come to the notice of the Government about blackmarketing in the sale of CGHS medicines?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: I do not think any report has come to the notice of the Government in this connection. Whenever there is a report we certainly look into it. As I said, 100 per cent success, 100 per cent foolproof service cannot be guranteed. We will try to see that as far as it is humanly possible these CGHS dispensaries and hospitals and the question of supply of drugs is made perfect, but still there will be some difficulties here and there. We will have to solve those difficulties as they arise. That area is always going to be open.

श्री शांति त्यागी : कई डिस्पेंसरीज में दवाइयां भी नहीं हैं और कई दफा अच्छी दवाइयां भी नहीं मिलती हैं। मेरा छोटा सा प्रश्न है कि आप जो ऐन्यूअल स्टाक दवाइयों का देते हैं उनका मूल्य निर्धारित है या वह कम ज्यादा हो सकता है ?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, I have not been able to follow the question.

श्री शान्ति त्यागी : मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि हर एक सी० जी० एच० एस० डिस्पेंसरी में जो दवाओं का स्टाक आप देते हैं क्या उसकी कीमत तय होती है या कम ज्यादा हो सकती है ?

श्री पी० वी० नरसिंह राव : उसका तो सवाल ही नहीं है, वह तो स्टोर से आता है उनके पास ।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : मैं मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूं कि दिल्ली का सब से बड़ा अस्पताल सफदरजंग अस्पताल है, वहां बार-बार ये शिकायतें आती हैं कि वहां जीवन-रक्षक दवाएं उपलब्ध नहीं रहती हैं, उनको पूरा करने के लिए आप क्या कदम उठा रहे हैं क्योंकि वहां करीब 12-13 लाख रोगी हर वर्ष आते हैं ?

दूसरी बात मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि जो हमारी राज्य मंत्री महोदया ने कहा है उसमें मैं सिर्फ इतना जोड़ना चाहता हूं कि पहले से भी जो एम०पी० लोगों के नजदीक में अस्पताल हैं उनमें जो दवाइयां नहीं रहती थीं तो सवेरे अगर दवा लिखी जाती थी तो शाम को सुपर मार्केट से मंगाकर वह अवश्य पूरी कर दी जाती थी । उसमें अब तीन चार रोज लग रहे हैं । इसको ऐक्सपिडाइट करने के लिए कदम आप उठाएं तो तुरंत हो जाएगा । इसमें तो आपको केवल आर्डर देने की बात है ।

SHRI P.V. NARASIMHA RAO: It is the same thing which I have answered already. We are going to undertake a review as to how much time lag is there and at what points the delay takes place and how we can minimise it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He says, if it was prescribed in the morning it used to be given in the evening but nowadays it takes more than two or three days.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO : There must be some thing wrong somewhere. The instructions are the same, they have not been altered that it should take three days instead of one.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Sir, my experience is quite different. My experience is that if the indent is given by the dispensary then the next day or within two days they supply the medicines. But during the inter-session period the doctor, the medical doctor, should be authorised to give the medicine between the end of the previous session and the beginning of the next session and that authority should be given to the medical officers and not to the higher authority. Otherwise during that period we have to buy from the market. At the time of review this matter should also be gone into.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: We will take note of it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your suggestion is accepted. Yes, Mr. Reddy.

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: Sir, I have not asked, I have not given my name.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sometimes I mistake. Yes, Mr. Mitra.

SHRI SANKAR PRASAD MITRA: Since Mr. Narasimha Rao has been good enough to state that the matter is going to be reviewed very soon, I think it is my duty to inform him that it is not possible nowadays for all CGHS dispensaries to keep all medicines that are prescribed by doctors. When the Medicines are not available in the dispensary itself they make an indent on the Super Bazar market. The Super Bazar market supplies the medicines and those medicines are supplied to the patients. But the Super Bazar market has no power to buy medicines from the open market if those medicines are not available with them. The patients are told to buy the medicines from the market and get money from the CGHS dispensary. I think Super Bazar should be empowered to buy medicines from the market if it is not in their stock.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO : Even the Incharge Medical Officer of the CGHS dispensary has the authority; if he does not get it from the Super Market, he can buy it from the authorised chemists. This authority is already there.

SHRI SANKAR PRASAD MITRA: But that authority is not being used.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next question.